楊天民（詭辯遁詞）公開信

Evasive Open letter of Paul Hattaway *(English below)*

Open letter Asia harvest. 詭 辯 遁 辭

這份公開信隱藏了十一英文段落沒有翻成中文讓華人能讀到。

备注：本公开信可任意转发和复制，也可在互联网上转载。

請先讀引起這封遁詞公開信的原因：1.林獻羔弟兄寫的中國大騙子天上人 2.中國家庭教會最有代表性的領袖和同工們的智仁勇公開信，都是Asia Harvest海特威逃避正面回應的。

針對海特威這份帶有極毒的遁詞公開信，林獻羔弟兄有非常有效的解藥，請先細讀免得被海特威Hattaway 污染了： 林林駁楊（中英文）

~~~~~~

关于"天上人"的一封公开信

我恳请各位读者能抽出宝贵的 10-15 分钟时间来读一读这封信。在信中，我愿意完全敞开我的心，与各位分享近一段时间来在一些基督的肢体中发生的一些事情，以及本人对这些事情的一些想法。

—— 《天上人》一书作者保罗•海特威 (Paul Hattaway)
~~~~~~

前言

首先我声明这封信绝无攻击他人之意，写这封公开信的目的乃在于立足真相，使基督的各肢体了解与目前遍传于亚洲乃至世界各地的言论完全不同的一面。埃得蒙·勃克（Edmund Burke）有句名言：“使魔鬼撒旦唯一能得逞的就是正直人袖手旁观。”同样，圣经中也提到：“不可叫你的善被人毁谤。”（罗 14:16）这节经文一直压在我的心头。在听取一些属灵长辈及亲朋好友的意见后，我感到现在是我站出来说两句公道话的时候了。说实在的，没人逼我写这封信，我之所以写，纯粹是出于朋友的立场，为其正名。

2001 年，我撰写了《天上人》一书，写的是中国基督徒云弟兄（刘振营）的见证。为了收集素材和背景资料，我到中国采访了许多人，他们都亲眼目睹了云弟兄的许多经历。我也和云弟兄度过了几个星期的时间，我们一起对他的故事进行重新编排整理。

在写书的过程中，我就知道有两件事将会发生。其一，我知道因着云弟兄非同一般的见证，此书一定会感动许多人，给他们的生命带来造就和祝福。尽管云弟兄有他的缺点和不足之处，但就是这样一个平凡的人，却一直与神同行，而这恰恰是全世界的基督徒渴望看到的。尤其在西方教会，我看到绝望正在信徒中蔓延滋长，他们对教会沉闷的传统和不温不火的现状已深感厌倦，他们知道一个基督徒的生命一定比自己曾经历的要丰富得多。云弟兄的生命和见证将一个谦卑虚己、忠心爱主、坚定不移的典范活生生地呈现在许多基督徒面前，触动了他们的生命。

其二，我也意料到此书将在基督徒圈子里掀起轩然大波和反对意见。其实教会是最难接受改变的地方。从教会历史中我们可以看到，一个昏睡的教会往往宁愿去攻击那些神差遣来让其改变的使者，也不愿意接受他们的教导和指正。旧约先知受神差遣来到以色列人中间却屡遭非难；而同样的状况在教会历史和当今的时代中一遍又一遍地重演。

具有讽刺意味的是，云弟兄的信息并不新鲜，也丝毫不具革新性，只不过和圣经一样耳熟能详。他的信息无不集中在耶稣基督的十字架上，说明信心的得胜属于那些在患难逼迫中依然信靠神的人。

本书的积极影响

我们先来看积极的一面。《天上人》一书被翻译成二十几种文字，出版发行量很大。在英国，该书被评为 2003 年度“最佳基督教书籍”以及 2004 年度“最佳传记”。我因此得到了许多祝福，各地基督徒的反响令我倍受鼓舞，给我来信的弟兄姊妹来自五湖四海。他们在信中告诉我，这本书如何鞭策了他们，令他们更加愿意紧紧跟随主。英国一个小教会的牧师在信中说，他读了这本书后，被圣灵深深地感动了。随后他便给教会每一位弟兄姊妹买了这本书。他们也被大大地挑旺了，更加自觉自愿地恒切祷告，更加热心地传福音。因着对主的这份重新被激起来的委身，教会在短期内急剧增长了一倍！

一些著名的基督徒领袖也因着这本书而蒙了祝福。德国布道家布永康（ Reinhard Bonnke）写道：

“也许一开始你是躺在沙发上读《天上人》这本书，然而到最后，你一定是跪着读完的。我自己就是这样的。任何一个人读这本书一定不会无动于衷。云弟兄的见证唤醒了我们，震撼了我们，告诉我们——在残酷逼迫患难中，被圣灵充满的神的子民是所向无敌的！他们在神的仇敌面前出生入死，将耶稣基督荣耀的福音传遍各国。胜利的喜讯将响彻四方！这凯旋不仅仅发生在中国，也会发生在世界各地。”

众多读者表达了他们对神的感恩，如：

马来西亚读者梅嘎写道：

“神在这末世的时候将这本书赐给我们。它使你认识到自己的属灵光景是多么的荒凉。这本书以及书中云弟兄所表现出来的坚定信心难以用言语来形容……你一定要认真读此书，如果不读，那么你就错过了神所赐下的美好礼物。愿神赐福给你，愿祂对你说话，就像祂籍着此书对我说话一样。”

美国俄亥俄州哥伦布的读者安德烈：

“从读第一章起，我就被强烈地震慑了！除了圣经以外，从来没有一本书能够这样撼动我，令我知罪。我越来越感到认识主耶稣是多么地有福，祂在全地以及在我们的生命中是何等的尊贵全能。这本书使我更加愿意为主摆上，我更加视圣经为瑰宝，对列国更加有负担。它重新更新了我对圣灵的渴慕与同在。我强烈推荐这本书。”

菲律宾宿务市读者里昂那多写道：

“我真希望给这本书评上六个星或七个星！很少有书能够实实在在地把你的人生改变得更加美好，而这绝对是一本这样的书！它是当今时代的经典之作，它或许将挑旺你的信心和生命，你读过的其它书都无法与之比拟。这才是基督教的精髓所在。这本书实在是宝贝，千万别错过。”

最后，美国俄亥俄州阿克郎的读者劳伦斯写道：

“我是在去非洲短宣的途中读这本书的。尽管日程安排得非常紧凑，可我还是见缝插针地在短短两天的时间里一口气读完了这本 400 多页的书。这是我读过的最好的书。我在非洲中部读这本书，它给我带来了无比的祝福。读完这本书，我强烈地感到无论付上什么样的代价，我都甚愿看到神国度的降临。云弟兄的故事和生命历程激起了我心中无法抑制的情感，我要去中国！明年六月我就要到中国去了。我向任何一个人极力推荐这本书。再多的无神论者也会被云弟兄的生命见证以及他为神国的付出所震慑。”

数以千计读者的感受我们可以从这一小部分见证中窥见一斑，我们为此向神献上感恩。愿荣耀归于祂！

“烟火”理论

就在这些振奋人心的鼓舞日渐展现的同时，我也看到了一股硝烟正逐步弥漫开来，那是一些针对云弟兄的品格和他见证的诽谤。起初我并没有将这些攻击太当回事，以为任何事奉神的人多少都会不可避免地面临一些反对。我认识云弟兄多年，也曾看到他忍受过诽谤和反对，其中也有一些是不同寻常的。

这些攻击主要源自于一名居住在德国汉堡的中国男子所主办的网站。他在网站上声称自己名叫林慕实。该网站所有的目的就是拆毁一个人——云弟兄。网站分别由中文、英语和德语组成，其目的是不遗余力、千方百计地破坏云弟兄的声誉，损害他的形象。里面充斥着各种谎言、诽谤、断章取义、道听途说

的无稽之谈；还在上面发表捏造的中国信徒的来信来抨击云弟兄。当这些中国信徒被问及之时，他们个个震惊不已，无不为自己的名字被他人盗用去诽谤他们一直深深敬爱的主内肢体而感到哀伤。八位颇有威望的中国牧者经过慎重调查后联名在以下网站上发表了一项声明，将调查结果公诸于众：

给海内外主内基督肢体的一封公开信

“我们愿意遵照圣经真理，为众教会合一的缘故，在此公开见证我们所配搭事奉与深入认识的刘振营弟兄（即《天上人》一书之作者），乃是谦卑诚实，单靠福音养生的忠心神仆。刘弟兄自年少蒙召以来，无日不为其信奉之独一真神及所领受之全备福音尽心竭力，并为一直在惦念中之中国大陆受苦、爱主的信徒效力及摆上。他对于金钱及圣徒的奉献忠心处理，绝不私留为己用；在职分上，也灭有自夸或高举自己，更从未自命为中国家庭教会之唯一合法代表。然而不幸有居住德国汉堡之某氏擅自散发损害刘弟兄名誉的信件、卡带和光盘给各教会。查其内容，全是歪曲杜撰，毫无凭据。其内中被引用之人士亦否认他们有任何中伤刘弟兄的举动，并表示该某氏的段章篡剪不但未经本人同意，也与事实相违。此事不但关系个人名节之荣辱成败，而且关乎基督国度之见证与合一，吾人不能袖手旁观，并坚决反对，特此声明，以正视听。同时切盼教会悉心分辨查验，不要中了撒旦的诡计，破坏欧洲福音事工的进展。所以我们决议联名致函向海内外各教会，澄清事实，支持刘振营弟兄在各地之福音事工，并号召世界众圣徒，合一将福音传回耶路撒冷，等候主荣耀的再临。”

（请参阅如下网址：http://www.backtojerusalem.com/Open%20Letter%20Chinese.pdf ）

著名的香港基督教复兴教会牧师包德宁牧师（Dennis Balcombe）说道：

> “我知道ＯＯＯ攻击云弟兄的事情，也知道背后的原因。一开始的时候我就强烈地反对这些恶意中伤，也多次对ＯＯＯ言明了我的立场。我为他执意任凭教会的仇敌用这种方式透过他来破坏主内肢体的声誉而感到难过和遗憾。他曾经说的和正在传达的所有言论纯属捏造。我们祷告祈求神在真诚的人心中作工，使他们看到事实的真相，并支持神高举的仆人云弟兄。”

这些诬告颇匪夷所思，许多基督徒居然都对此深信不疑。更令人费解是，甚至一些知名的教会高层领导人也受其蒙蔽。各种批评论断和对立言论不断涌现，有些人还极尽编造之能事用流言蜚语含沙射影地破坏云弟兄的声誉，不经调查核实就以讹传讹，还乐此不疲。这些传言不仅在中国基督徒中如星星之火般迅速蔓延，而且使得西方教会的宣教士和牧者们也信以为真，尽管他们“想要作教法师，却不明白自己所讲说的，所论定的。”（提前 1:7）。几乎都每天有不少道听途说的人向我打听这些事，他们也是听别人说的，而别人也是从网上看到的！

这种逻辑推断是完全不符合圣经原则的，神的子民一旦沉湎于此是极其危险的。撒旦如果想要破坏某个神的孩子的声誉，它所要做的仅仅是开始制造一点点谣言而已。它知道只需挑个头，自会有信徒来帮它完成其余的散布工作！发生在云弟兄身上的情况就是如此。不知何故，在中国这样的罪尤其普遍。难得看到有谁称许别人，说别人好话的人并不多见。我认为这是中国教会最大的弊病之一，也是阻碍教会在这个世代蒙神祝福、迎接极大复兴的主要威胁之一。

No Chinese Translation 1: Part of the problem is that around the world the Chinese house churches are usually presented in all their glory, as great men and women of God who live in perfect harmony. It is thought that some leaders have suffered in prison for so long that they are practically sinless! The reality is a little more down-to-earth. It has been said "The Chinese Church has a New Testament kind of Christianity." I agree! But in the New Testament we read not only of miracles and revival, but also of personal conflict, jealousy, opposition, and "false brothers." A glance at the messages the Risen Christ gave to the seven

churches in the early chapters of Revelation will soon reveal the early Christians were just like us - with many weaknesses and failings.

無中文翻譯1：問題的一部分在於，在世界各地，中國家庭教會通常被描繪得無比光鮮，彷彿都是完美和諧的上帝僕人。人們甚至認為，有些領袖在獄中受苦多年，幾乎毫無罪孽！但事實遠比這更貼近現實。有人說「中國教會擁有新約式的基督教信仰」。我同意！但在新約中，我們讀到的不僅是神蹟和復興，還有個人衝突、嫉妒、反對和「假弟兄」。只要略讀復活的基督在啟示錄前幾章給七個教會的信息，就會發現早期基督徒和我們一樣——也有許多軟弱和過錯。

许多人相信这样一种说法：“有烟冒出来的地方肯定就有火在烧。”意思是说假如人们对一个弟兄说三道四，那就肯定不是空穴来风，多少都有些真的。这种理论完全与圣经不符，而且极度危险。如果这个理论成立，那么耶稣俨然就是罪人了！祂被法利赛人以及许多人强烈谴责，他们把各种罪名都堆到祂的头上。祂一直是人们竞相争论的焦点人物。耶稣周围弥漫着太多的“烟雾”，而实际上却没有火点着。唯一点着的是祂心中对失丧灵魂的那份爱！还有其他诸多圣经人物同样也蒙受过各样的不白之冤，比如摩西、亚伦、以赛亚、耶利米、尼希米、约书亚、使徒保罗等等，此处列举的只是一小部分。

教会中的“友军开火”

最近几年来，在伊拉克战场上的美国士兵们引用了一个新词来形容在战斗中牺牲或负伤的最糟糕的情景。他们解释说，假如他们是被敌人的枪弹打死打伤，那是极大的光荣；可最糟糕最令他们感到窝囊的就是被自己的战友”友军开火”的枪弹误伤打中。那种被自己的战友误伤的感觉简直太可怕了！

不幸且更悲惨的是，这种“友军开火”如今却在神的子民中打响！像云弟兄这样的基督徒认为如果他在地球的某个偏远角落传福音，因而遭到穆斯林或某个原始部落族群的击杀，他会将之视为极大的荣耀；可如果被原本应该和自己并肩作战的主内肢体射杀，那是何等悲惨和可怕的光景啊！

令人伤痛的是，有些基督徒总把那些素未谋面、他们根本不了解的人往最坏的地方去想。假如一个新来的传道人宣讲了一篇从神得着的新信息，随后各种对他的动机和人品的猜忌和假设就会接踵而至，比如：“他们肯定是为了敛财，”、“他想用假信息来招摇撞骗。”

圣灵对此番情景该有多么痛心忧伤啊！

尽管“友军开火”是一个新兴名词，但不幸的是，它实际上从使徒行传时代教会诞生时就已经为信徒所熟用了。纵观基督教历史，我们可以看到，神降下的复兴之火往往是被那些教会领导人因着无知和盲目的热情为了“保护”福音而熄灭的，然而他们时常逼迫的正是他们自己不了解的。

历史上许多伟大的基督徒领袖大都成了其他基督徒残酷攻击的对象。记者亚历克斯·布珊（Alex Buchan）对此发表了一些看法，文章刊登在 1997 年 11 月 21 日的基督教刊物《指南针（*Compass Direct*）》上。布珊的文章报道的是某教会的一位知名带领人遭到另一名带领人诽谤攻击的事情。文章写道：

> “他的反应或许对我感触更深，因为几天前在我读有关教父的文章时也有同感。当读到伟大的德土良（*迦太基基督教神学家，大约于公元 193 年依附基督教，约 207 年与天主教教会分裂并建立了自己的分裂性教派。他的著作对西方神学影响极大*）对异端分子普罗修斯进行残忍攻击时，我瞠目结舌。其程度之残忍令人发指，无法想象。我怀着极其失望的心情读到所谓“仁慈医生”的圣·奥古斯汀彻头彻尾的冷漠无情，他使多纳图斯派教徒（*多纳图斯派宗教严格主义者，主张分裂的基督教派，受到圣·奥古斯汀强烈反对， 公元 4 世纪于北非兴起，认为圣洁是成为教会成员和圣事的施行的必需条件*）遭到了军队的镇压。”

看来这是个事实，许多属灵伟人在被神的爱所激发的同时，对他们所认为的神仇敌的恨意也非常强烈，他们心中当然也因此倍受煎熬。

欲参阅全文，请访问如下网址：

http://www.strategicnetwork.org/index.php?loc=kb&view=v&id=531&fwo=samuel%20lamb%20revival&&

令人遗憾的是，“友军开火”在中国也不鲜见。最近，我在为一本新书作研究时读到一些文章，讲的是 1305 年在北京的景教教徒如何强烈抨击门诺会的约翰（John of Montecorvino——*教皇尼古拉四世派遣方济各修士约翰以教廷使节身份来中国，在主后 1294 年抵达大都，获准在中国居留及传教。约翰的传教工作虽然遭到景教徒的一些阻挠，但大致上仍顺利开展，教堂及信徒人数均有增长。*）的记载。约翰在以前的数年间为六千人施洗，却被心怀妒忌的景教教徒诋毁为“间谍、巫师、骗子”。约翰后来评论说：“若不是因为这些诽谤，我施洗的人应该可以超过三万。”

在二十世纪早期的威尔士大复兴时期，神使用一个名叫伊凡·罗伯茨（Evan Roberts）的年轻人作为祂的器皿，为这个灵魂干渴的国家带来了祝福。然而，当时威尔士绝大多数的神职人员强烈反对罗伯茨的事工，害怕他带来的影响将危及到“他们的”教廷。威尔士几十名神甫联名在报纸上刊登了长达数页的整版公告，公然指控伊凡·罗伯茨为异端分子和骗子。而今，伊凡·罗伯茨这个名字却因着神使用他在一百多年前给威尔士带来的复兴而为全世界的人所纪念，而那些中伤他的人的名字如今却一个都没留下。类似的遭遇也发生在奋兴家查尔斯·芬尼（Charles Finney）和慕迪（D.L. Moody）身上，他们同样也遭到了其他基督徒领袖的公然诋毁。

No Chinese Translation 2: Even Billy Graham has been strongly attacked throughout the years of his faithful ministry for his Lord. His autobiography records how a series of early meetings in England met with tremendous opposition from the churches, who opposed him and did all they could to send the evangelist back to America. A friend of mine who attended a Billy Graham crusade in the United States several years ago told me of his astonishment when he saw a group of Christians protesting outside the stadium, holding up signs saying things like, "Don't listen to this man. His teaching will send you to hell!"

無中文翻譯 2（這一段 作者後來偷偷刪掉了，不敢給西方人看）：

即使是葛培理，在他多年來忠心事奉主的過程中，也一直受到猛烈的攻擊。他的自傳記錄了他在英國早期的一系列佈道會如何遭到教會的強烈反對，教會反對他，並竭盡所能將這位福音傳道者趕回美國。幾年前，我的一位朋友參加了葛培理在美國的一次佈道會，他告訴我，當他看到一群基督徒在體育場外抗議，舉著諸如「不要聽這個人的話。他的教導會把你送進地獄！」之類的標語時，他感到非常震驚。

首先我们应该认清谁才是这场攻击神子民的真正幕后黑手。圣经说道：“因我们并不是与属血气的争战，乃是与那些执政的，掌权的，管辖这幽暗世界的，以及天空属灵气的恶魔争战。（弗 6:12）”我们多么盲目无知啊！我们不可能既与黑暗势力交战，同时自己人之间又互相争斗。因此，撒旦知道一旦它能使基督徒反对基督徒，那么它已经赢了，它的阴谋已经得逞了。使徒保罗在很早以前就已经向哥林多教会指出这一点了：“你们彼此告状，这已经是你们的大错了。（林前 6:7）”

对云弟兄的攻击

我在前面已经提到，一个在德国汉堡居住的名叫ＯＯＯ的中国男子设立了一个网站，在网站上他自称“林慕实”（Lin Mushe）。他恶毒地声称云弟兄是骗子、窃贼。

在此我只想提一个简单的问题：如果一个自称是基督徒的人如此醉心于除掉另一个基督徒，那么我们作为基督徒，会不会觉得这有点儿不太对劲，是不是值得怀疑？

对云弟兄的诽谤攻击以各种形式层出不穷，有互联网、电子邮报、录相带、录音带、影碟等，可谓种类繁多。而所有这些皆源自同一出处。ＯＯＯ何故这么做？其动机

不值得去下结论。我一直都在试图联系他，可所有的去信都如石沉大海。更令人百思不得其解的是，九十年代末ＯＯＯ却是云弟兄的热心拥护者，他甚至是第一个在西方极力推广云弟兄及其见证的人。No Chinese Translation : Link. (For example, see the "China" testimony here).

所有这些攻击一开始造成的影响微乎其微，直到那个德国的网站说服三位德高望重的中国教会领袖林献羔、谢模善、袁相忱写了一封反对云弟兄的联名信后才掀起了轩然大波。他们在信中要云弟兄“赶紧趁早认罪悔改”。林献羔甚至还写了一篇名为《中国大骗子天上人》的短文，以中英文的形式分发给前去他广州教会的每一个人。

许多人认为连这三位德高望重的属灵前辈都说云弟兄是个骗子，那他肯定就是个骗子无疑。毕竟林献羔老先生为福音的缘故蹲了二十几年大牢，被视为教会蒙受逼迫的英雄人物，受到全世界基督徒的景仰。若非情况属实，像他那样受人爱戴的人当然不会凭白无故发表言论反对另一个弟兄的。

首先，我认为让教会对行骗使诈者和异端分子保持警惕当然是件好事。圣经实际上也告诫我们要如此行，而且这样败坏堕落的现象也是末世的征兆之一。（请参看马太福音 24：4-5）。倘若云弟兄真的犯有那些可怕的罪，即或只是一点点，那么其他人当然有责任去警告他。不过，圣经中也清楚地指明，如果有人犯了罪危及他人，别人当以何种方式去揭发他。如果有人不严格依照圣经原则来执行，那么他就是蓄意破坏他人名誉，制造谣言、散布谣言。通常有的是搬弄是非嚼舌头的人惟恐天下不乱。

圣经对此类情况首先指出的就是：一旦有谁犯了错，应当向他当面提出。耶稣教导我们：“倘若你的弟兄得罪你，你就去，趁着只有他和你在一处的时候，指出他的错来，他若听你，你便得了你的弟兄；他若不听，你就另外带一两个人同去，要凭两三个人的口作见证，句句都可定准。若是不听他们，就告诉教会；若是不听教会，就看他象外邦人和税吏一样。（太 18:15-17）”使徒保罗对如何对待陷在罪里的弟兄是这样教导的：“弟兄们，若有人偶然被过犯所胜，你们属灵的人就当用温柔的心把他挽回过来；又当自己小心，恐怕也被引诱。（加 6:1）”。

那么在反对云弟兄的事情上，

No Chinese translation 3: Did Samuel Lamb or the other elderly Chinese brothers

無中文翻譯 3 ： 林獻羔或其他年長的中國兄弟，

有没有人遵循这些“有人犯罪，当面提出”的圣经原则呢？

显然没有！

你或许不相信，林献羔老牧师自己都承认他以前从来没有见过云弟兄，也没有读过他的书。事实上，除了从ＯＯＯ/林慕实那里听来的以外，林老牧师对云弟兄的生活或事工知之甚少。因此，他的攻击显然毫无意义。诚然，一个人如果素未谋面就对另一个人进行人格攻击，那么他的言辞必定也丝毫没有可信之处。

自八十年代末以来，我自己在林献羔的教会里与林老牧师本人见面不下十五次。就在最近，2005 年 6 月 27 日上午，我还和他谈了话。他和以前一样和蔼可亲，笑容可鞠。他承认以前从未见过云弟兄，即便有机会，他也会拒绝和云见面，因为云是个“坏人”。林老牧师还说他是从德国的林慕实那里听说的那些事。当我提出他的信息来源可能有误时，林老牧师只是笑笑，不置可否。当我问他对一个素未谋面的人进行公然抨击是否正确时，他依然和善地笑笑，没有回答。同时他还在向来到他教会的人派发他的《骗子》一文。我的同工也试图与居住北京的谢模善和袁相忱老弟兄谈及此事，可他们同样也不愿意解释为什么要在那封信上签名。这两位令人尊敬的前辈承认他们在许多年前曾见过云弟兄，可后来再也没见过。

就算是不信主的人也不会听信他们这样的说法；

No Chinese Translation 4:Can you imagine the scene in court where one person is accusing the other of some horrible crime? The judge leans forward and asks the accuser, "How long have you known this man?" The accuser, red-faced, whispers, "Ah, actually I

have never met him before your honor..."
無中文翻譯4：你能想像法庭上，一個人指控另一個人犯下某種可怕的罪行嗎？法官俯身向前，問原告：“你認識這個人多久了？”原告滿臉通紅，低聲說道：“啊，尊貴法官大人陛下，其實我從未見過他……”

就算是属世的法官也不会接受一个对素未谋面的人的指控！这实在是无稽之谈，可就是有那么多的基督徒居然仅仅因着这三位属灵老前辈的声望而不假思索地认为针对云弟兄的指控是属实的。

可悲的是这种人身攻击和人格损毁在当今的中国实在是太普遍了。2004 年 12 月，一名神曾使用的祝福过中国的美国弟兄给众多中国教会带领人写了一封长长的电子邮件，为同样的事情谴责他们，说他们不应该在基督徒圈子里散布谣言、诽谤他人。这位弟兄写道：

> “有些人认为把他们自己的想法说出来，并把听来的消息重复给别人听是自己的‘事工’。我接受的则是这样的教导——我们要为自己说过的每一句虚妄的话在神面前有交代。如今有一种危险的征兆， 似乎人们都缺乏敬畏神的心， 特别是中国教会……有些似乎是以打击别人为乐事。我们时常会需要有点故事去说说，或者要有点什么事去反对反对。而所有这些会令我们成为搬弄是非的人。
>
> “为什么人们到中国来，还计划见一些教会带领人并听一听他们的故事？即或有弟兄犯了罪，那么他所做的没有不显露出来的，不在今生，也会在基督的审判台前昭然若揭。圣灵并不需要你我在世界上作祂的代言人，去警告我们的弟兄犯了什么罪……其实，人为的控告对神仆人的生命或事工果效产生不了什么影响，神并没有把这样的权柄赐给你我。惟有祂自己才是全能的。”

一位在东欧共产主义国家及前苏联有过多年工作经验的作家来到中国时，也略微谈到共产主义国家中基督徒工作的另一令人深思的方面。实际上，有些教会带领人已经向政府妥协，成了政府手中的工具。结果，政府利用那些被他们收买的牧者和教会带领人制造出一些最为恶毒的攻击和诽谤。他说道：

> “在共产主义国家，即使你得到的消息来自一百个可靠渠道，那也可能是假的。这就是为什么圣经也清楚地教导我们当怎样来处理此类事情……中国家庭教会里安插着许多奸细，我们不能太天真了。”

眼看着云弟兄面临如此众多的争战，我却惊讶地看到他对所有这些针对他的抨击都报之以敬虔的回应。他非但没有进行任何公开的争辩，反而完全宽恕了所有逼迫他的人，一点都不忌恨。

那么云弟兄对那三位中国教会的属灵前辈又是如何反应的呢？他心里有没有苦毒？会不会报复？那么我们就来听听云弟兄是怎么说的吧：

> “在主面前我想说的是，对写我文章的那几位神的仆人我绝对没有任何的敌视，我已经完全原谅了他们。其实，我心中对他们的深深敬意并没有因这些文章而减少丝毫。
>
> 我深知总有一天我们会在天上相会，在我们的父神面前握手言欢。当我们一起敬拜神羔羊的时刻，一切的误解终将化为乌有。
>
> 如果任何人对于我的经历有任何问题或质疑，我非常愿意在公开场合或私下里和大家见面，并回答大家的任何问题。
>
> 让我们摒弃一切障碍，为了神的国度而共同携手前进吧！”

轩然大波

互联网上公开传播的这些反对云弟兄的虚假言论正中了某些人的下怀，他们早就想看到云弟兄因此而被击垮。几家基督教刊物还对这些谣传大肆渲染，就连好些西方和亚洲国家的教会领袖也人云亦云、信以为真。成千上万的基督徒曾被云弟兄的见证

所激励、所祝福，然而当他们看到这三位中国教会前辈公然质疑云弟兄，说他的见证是捏造后，他们的心情该有多么低落！我都能想象出此刻魔鬼正在一旁窃笑的得意模样！多少信徒在读云弟兄的书时心中涌起的灵里的感动及被挑旺的信心都被这些指控泯灭了。

在美国，谣言和捏造的传闻已经开始在教会团体中广为传播。

No Chinese Translation 5: One large church in Wisconsin even purchased 1,000 *The Heavenly Man* books for the members of their congregation, only to send them back to the publisher after they were told the story is untrue by a visiting mission leader.

無中文翻譯 5：威斯康辛州的一間大型教會甚至為他們的會眾購買了 1000 本《天上人》，但在一位來訪的宣教領袖告訴他們這個故事是不真實之後，他們又把這些書退還給了出版社。

现在韩国众多的教会带领人也打算发表公开声明，宣称云弟兄为异端分子和骗子，尽管云弟兄从未去过韩国，而且打算发表声明的人也从未见过云弟兄，也没和他交谈过。

感谢主，并不是所有的人都那么匆忙地盲目作出不符合圣经原则的论断。马来西亚的一个大教会在处理这个事件时显示了他们的智慧。去年下半年，云弟兄曾受邀在马来西亚作了一系列的巡回演讲，他的书影响了当地几千人的生命。此次巡回演讲是由当地人所熟知和尊敬的全国性教会团体“马来西亚全国基督徒福音团契 National Evangelical Christian Fellowship of Malaysia (NECF)”承办的。

在演讲会上，马来西亚全国有一千二百多人第一次决心委身跟随基督！许多人认罪悔改，得到了神的怜悯和恩典，成了神的儿女；几千名基督徒因着云弟兄的见证而倍受鼓舞，在跟随主的道路上信心被挑旺，得蒙了造就。

No Chinese translation 6: As usual, Yun refused to leave each meeting place until all the people who wanted to meet him and talk with him had the chance to do so. Sometimes this meant he did not get to sleep until the early hours of the morning as hundreds of people stayed behind for prayer or just to have a chat with Brother Yun. I have personally seen on numerous occasions how patient, kind and loving he is with people - giving them his full attention and displaying a genuine concern for their wellbeing. Yun figures that Jesus cares for people deeply, and so should he.

無中文翻譯6：和往常一樣，雲弟兄堅持要等到所有想見他、與他交談的人都有機會之後，才離開聚會地點。有時這意味著他要撐到凌晨才能睡覺，因為數百人留下來禱告，或只是和雲弟兄聊聊天。我親眼見過他待人多麼耐心、和藹、充滿愛心——他全神貫注地傾聽，並真誠地關心他們的福祉。雲弟兄認為耶穌深愛世人，他也應該如此。

如今在马来西亚，在大多数云弟兄的所到之处，好与坏并存！

在神使用云弟兄为主耶稣感动更多生命的同时，在那些读过云弟兄谣传的众教会带领人中也兴起了一股反对云弟兄的强烈热潮，他们都不遗余力地企图破坏聚会的举行。云弟兄每到一处，就有一大堆一大堆的来信已经先期到达，抗议聚会的举行，谴责云弟兄在许多其他事情上是个假先知。毕竟他们已经在网上读到了关于云弟兄的众多言论，他们相信那一定都是真的。

这些反对舆论置ＮＥＣＦ于非常艰难的境地。一方面聚会都已经安排好了；而另一方面，反对演讲嘉宾的风暴正席卷而来，舆论纷纷就一系列的事情谴责他。就连一些接待云弟兄住在他们家的马来西亚牧师们也因招待他而遭到了猛烈攻击！

随同云弟兄马来西亚之行的ＮＥＣＦ秘书长王牧师（Rev. Wong Kim Kong）事后写道：

> “天上人的马来西亚之行在八打灵交也、吉隆坡、槟榔屿、怡保及新山激起了强烈反响。在他由北向南跨越马来西亚半岛的巡回演讲结束之际，许多人对他发出的各项挑战作出了积极的回应，他挑战人们接受耶稣为救主、投身于福音事工、或参与‘回归

耶路撒冷运动’，将福音带到中国和耶路撒冷之间的众多国家和地区。

“刘振营——这位大家所熟知的云弟兄，实在是神放在我们面前的有力见证。当然，他的到访的确引起了诸多争论。就连他在台上讲道的时候，攻击他、质疑他真实性的电子邮件也在迅速传播，其中绝大多数都指向一个出处——那个专为驳斥他的见证而设立的网站。该网站断言云弟兄是个争权谋利的骗子，还刊登了诸如林献羔、谢模善以及袁相忱等几位中国教会领导人在呼吁云弟兄认罪悔改的信上签名的照片。”

感谢主，王牧师和“马来西亚全国基督徒福音团契(NECF)”实在是一群成熟的基督徒，他们在云弟兄的事情上并没有以反对他的舆论来作为依据，而是凭着他基督般的品格和他事工所结出的美好果子来看待他。王牧师后来还写了另一篇题为《讲员筛选》的文章，文中就他们这个团体在对有争议的受邀讲员的事情上列举了一些圣经的原则和步骤：

“假如候选讲员是一个有争议的人物，或有名声不佳之嫌该怎么办？

王牧师指出：“首先我们将查明谣传的依据，还要时刻提醒自己，现今社会电子邮件以及其他各种形式的媒体已被某些别有用心的人滥用，以此来伤害及诽谤他人。

人格诋毁背后的原因可能有许多，例如性格差异、神学见解和事工方向的不同、事工间的争竞、嫉妒，或许根本就只是恶作剧。

我们基督徒也和任何一个常人一样，会受肉体情欲的试探，所以有一点很重要，就是要考虑到原被告之间是否也存在着这些问题。”他如此警告道。

“对于针对某讲员的信息或指控一定要经过多方仔细的调查研究，不能单单听取一面之词，一定要确保有一个公正的听证。‘我们还将就该讲员广泛听取多人的意见。比如此次在云弟兄（天上人）的事情上，两位世界上受人尊敬的传道人领袖大卫·鲍森（David Pawson）及包德宁（Dennis Balcombe）都对云弟兄给予了高度的评价。’”

愿其他教会的带领人在作决定的时候也能够运用同样的智慧！

云弟兄人品的见证

我和云弟兄接触得比较多，所以相对比较了解情况。在我看来，在诸多教会中闹得沸沸扬扬的争议大致分为两个阵营——不了解云弟兄的人和了解云弟兄的人。

全世界和云弟兄有过接触的有几千人，他们都发现他人很好，谦卑、仁爱，总渴望在基督里给别人带来祝福和造就。那些参加过他聚会的人能凭着自己的见解来判断此人究竟是个爱耶稣基督的人还是个为己牟利的大骗子。

当然我也可以向你坦言，云弟兄并非完人，他也像我们任何一个人一样有缺点和不足之处，然而他远还没有像批评他为人的那些人所指控的那样卑鄙败坏。以我的经验来看，那些遇见过云弟兄的人无不看到了他的谦卑和对耶稣的热心。在他所到之处，从他生命结出的美好果子比比皆是：不信的人们重生得救；原本已经信主的则对主越来越委身。无庸置疑，无论云弟兄到哪里传讲福音，哪里就有他为主留下的美好果子。耶稣说过：“凭着他们的果子，就可以认出他们来。荆棘上岂能摘葡萄呢？蒺藜里岂能摘无花果呢？这样，凡好树都结好果子；惟独坏树结坏果子。（太 7:16-17）”

一名英国牧师哥顿·希克森（Gordon Hickson）说道：

“几年来，我一直和云弟兄在回归耶路撒冷项目上亲密地配搭同工。在此期间，我曾为云弟兄在整个英国组织了许多的聚会。对于那些认识云弟兄以及了解他的聚会是如何组织的人来说，如此责难他滥用金钱简直太可笑了。事实是：在世界各地举办的云弟兄的聚会中，云弟兄自己从来没有碰过捐赠钱款中的一分钱，而且向来如此。他从不强调捐款，除了请求代祷以外，他从不向任何人要过什么。

“在英国和欧洲各地，云弟兄让我们认识到的没有别的，只有榜样，他是我们的榜样。他个人对英国的教会产生了很大的影响。他的书以及他举办的许多聚会上提出的

观点唤醒了英国教会对自身使命的呼召和责任。我们非常敬重他的人品、他的谦卑、他的负责以及在财政上的透明。他个人没有直接接触过聚会的收入，所有这些收入全部用于‘回归耶路撒冷’的事工。”

德国牧师瓦尔德马·萨达祖克（Waldemar Sardaczuk）是著名欧洲宣教团体Aktionskommitee fur Verfolgte Christen (AVC).的会长。他最近证实道：

“云弟兄一家人曾经和我们一起在德国尼达居住多年，我们对他和妻子都非常熟悉。他们是我们教会的会友，是与神同行的的一个伟大见证。多年前我曾在中国见过云弟兄，当时我绝没有想到可能会在德国见到他。但是神将他带出来，让他成为整个世界教会的一个祝福。就像所有蒙神使用的神的仆人一样，云弟兄也成了众多诽谤、攻击和嫉妒的对象……云弟兄实在是个大大的祝福，他是神的仆人，神使用他打开了我们的眼睛，让我们看到中国基督徒的境遇。”

无数反对云弟兄的指控在到处传播着，可我依然等待着以任何方式来和一个被他错待的人会会面。

对具体指控的解答

我听到的各种各样关于云弟兄的责难和谣传实在是太多了，根本没办法全都记住！有些简直太荒谬太幼稚了，根本不值得一答，诸如“云弟兄从来不祷告”、“他再也不跟随主了”、“他因为走私黄金而被捕”等等。我持续听到的指控主要有十条，所以在此我一一作答：

1. “云弟兄是个百万富翁，在西方过着帝王般的奢靡生活。”

事实是，云弟兄和他的家人在德国过着简朴的生活。一个叫 AVC 的宣教团体为云弟兄及其家人提供住所已经好几年了，而且一直在照顾他们的生活。在上面我已经提到，德国牧师瓦尔德马·萨达祖克（Waldemar Sardaczuk）在今年早些时候分享了云弟兄日常生活的见证：

“我可以分享一些云弟兄和他家人日常生活中的见证……无论是他还是他的家人都没开过车，也不曾拥有过一辆车。他们的全部精力都在事奉主，很少关心物质层面。他的生活方式、他的行为以及他的家庭都与圣经的教导一致。云弟兄对所有关于他的谎言、诽谤和指控的反应让我们很欣赏，也给我们留下了深刻的印象……他总是不遗余力地帮助他祖国遭受逼迫的基督徒，没有一丝追求个人利益或荣耀的欲望。”

2. “云弟兄窃取他在世界各地举行的聚会上募集的款项。”

这种指控简直荒谬至极！云弟兄从不经手从任何地方募集来的一分钱！早在几年前，云弟兄就已经决定，他的巡回演讲一定要由那些已经在中国参与事工的现有事工团体以及具有良好声誉的人来主办。一直以来他们就是那么做的，这就意味着捐赠款项均由主办方来支配。得知这些钱款最终将用于祝福中国的信徒，云很高兴。比如，最近云在欧洲举办了将近 20 场聚会，主办方是一事工团体。他们将所募集的捐赠用于该团体在中国现有的福音事工，他们在中国的工作已经开展了 15-20 年。这种情况同样也发生在云演讲的其他世界各国。有些聚会的捐赠则直接进入到中国的工作中，通常所得款项先集中到一个香港的机构，随后按照预先指定的汇往中国。而该机构的财务是独立审核的。从云弟兄在世界各地的聚会所得捐赠我了解到，成千上万册圣经被印刷；成百名传道人得到了支持；训练中心被建立；另外，许多援助纷纷以各种方式前来帮助建立中国的教会。而这些指控可怕就可怕在通过打击云弟兄，在中国展开的各项工作就遭到了间接的破坏。

3. “云和他的同工妄称已经有 100，000 名中国宣教士被派出中国，或准备离开中国。”

云从来没有这样宣称过。100，000 名中国宣教士是一个异像，可能要经过许多年

以后才有可能成为现实。《天上人》一书及《回归耶路撒冷》一书均有清楚的陈述。其中的一本书在提到关于该异像的时间时是这么说的：“我们没有自己的时间表；我们只想遵循神的旨意，把进度留给祂。”我看到 100，000 这个数字和圣经中约书亚和迦勒的境遇有相似之处。有人看到的是中国福音事工运动的潜能，尽管目前还处在初期阶段；而有人看到的只是问题。这令我想起“青年事工”(Youth With A Mission)创始人劳伦·昆宁翰（Loren Cunningham）的初创时期。他有一个异像，就是成千上万名青年人在全世界的禾场上事奉主耶稣。尽管当时的现实和这个异像丝毫不符，但他仍在各教会中公开分享他的异像。一些教会带领人甚至谴责昆宁翰是在撒谎，这和如今人们对云弟兄做的如出一辙。

4. “从中国差派出 100，000 个宣教士纯属夸大其辞，根本无法实现。”

当今中国绝大多数教会对于信徒数字的估算介于五千万至一亿之间。我们暂且保守一点，以较低的五千万作为相对精确的数字。这一代的中国教会从每 500 名信徒中差派 1 名宣教士出去难道不可能实现吗？最近基于菲律宾的一个跨宗派机构“菲律宾事工动员运动”（ Philippine Mission Mobilization Movement）宣布他们的异像是向外差派 200，000 名菲律宾宣教士！在总人口仅为中国的二十五分之一的韩国基督教会也已经向海外输送了 12000 名宣教士。

No Chinese Translation 7: according to Patrick Johnstone's latest Operation World (p.387). The same source says in 2001 there were already 201,260 Protestant missionaries throughout the world (p.4), with possibly a similar number of Catholic missionaries.

無中文翻譯 7：根據帕特里克·約翰斯通最新著作《世界行動》（第387頁），同一資料顯示，2001年全世界已有201260名新教傳教士（第4頁），天主教傳教士的數量可能與之相近。

5. “《天上人》一书及《回归耶路撒冷》一书导致了中国信徒蒙受更大的逼迫。”

这简直是胡说八道。我们从未听说有哪一个人因为这两本书中的任何一本而被捕。事实上，自这两本书出版的过去几年中，在中国被捕的信徒数字已经下降。

6. “1984 年，云弟兄从来没有在监狱里禁食过 74 天。”

我当然清楚这个见证超乎寻常，而且以人类的条件确实完全不可能。不过耶稣说过：“在人是不能，在神却不然，因为神凡事都能（可 10:27）。”云弟兄禁食结束时的身体状况是有目击证人的，包括他的牧师、他妻子德灵、以及其他亲属都在监狱亲眼目睹了他萎缩的身体，而那些指责他的人当时却不在场。我也听到过云确实于 1984 年在狱中禁食 74 天的有力证据。

No Chinese Translation 8: In researching the book I spent a couple of weeks with Brother Yun himself, going over his account. To make sure any language problems were minimized, I asked a Chinese friend from Taiwan, who has spent decades translating (including for leaders such as Billy Graham) to be involved with our interviews so that we could get an accurate translation. No stone was left unturned in our effort to achieve this.

無中文翻譯 8：在寫本書的過程中，我花了幾個星期的時間與雲弟兄本人交流，仔細聆聽他的敘述。為了盡可能減少語言上的問題，我邀請了一位來自台灣的中國朋友參與我們的採訪，他從事翻譯工作數十年（曾為葛培理等領袖翻譯），以便我們能夠獲得準確的翻譯。為了達到這個目標，我們竭盡全力，不放過任何細節。

云在狱中禁食 74 天迄今为止已经广为人知许多年了。香港复兴教会的包德宁牧师说道：

“1991 年我翻译了一本名为《荆棘中的百合花》的书。其作者丹云其实是一家庭教会的带领人，他花费了两年时间仔细地调查研究了书中所描述的那些见证。他和河南

教会的一位受过教育的作家一起撰写了我翻译的那部书稿。我自己也作了相当多的调查研究来确保书中内容的真实性与准确性。书中有一章题为《天上人》，长达 57 页的内容讲述了云弟兄的故事，这一部分的细节与保罗·海特威所著《天上人》一书的开头部分完全吻合。素材的来源不同，而内容则相同。很早以前云就为人所熟知，或者已经有了关于他见证的争论，在河南，人们曾公开谈论他在狱中的见证、禁食和祷告，以及其它一些如今已经广为人知的细节。”

人的看法实在是有意思。有些信徒奚落这个见证，说那是完全不可能的。可我和来自印度东北部那加兰邦一偏远地区的几名牧师分享此事时，却没人对此感到惊讶或怀疑。后来一名牧师向我道明了原因。他说在六十年代一阵强有力的复兴到来时，大家都知道有一名牧师禁食了 100 天！

7. “1997 年，云弟兄从未奇迹般地从监狱逃出。”

这是林献羔牧师攻击云弟兄的主要论点之一。在我为写云弟兄的书作调查时，我采访了三位目击者。他们亲眼目睹了这一神奇经过。他们都是教会的带领人，和云一起在同一个聚会被捕，当时也被关在同一所监狱。即使我对他们每一个人都在不同时间不同地点分别进行的采访，然而他们的描述却是一致的。另外我们还有云越狱后立即前往的那个家庭的见证。作为“天上人”这本书的作者，我毫不犹豫地把这个见证放进了云的书里。这一边是我有一群目击证人，他们的见证都和云有直接关系；而另一边的见证人当时并不在场，而且根本不了解事情的经过。我在此公开声明我仍然确信我在《天上人》一书中所写的见证是真实准确的。

8. “云弟兄不是全中国教会的领袖。”

阿们！他从来没这么宣称过，谁要敢这么说，那肯定是疯了。耶稣基督才是全中国教会的领袖。云离开中国后，由家庭教会带领人组成的希尼团契长老们推举云作为希尼团契的“全权代表”，并写信证实了这一点。

No Chinese Translation 9: which was translated and included in The Heavenly Man book (p.291-292).

無中文翻譯 9：譯本被翻譯並收錄在《天上人》一書中（第 291-292 頁）。

说云是一中国家庭教会网络的主要领袖这一断言可能是由别人错误杜撰出来的，当然从来没有从云弟兄口里说出来。其实任何一个了解云的人都意识到他并不愿意引起别人的注意，所以在过去的几年中他要求在介绍他时只简单地称其为“从中国来的一名基督徒弟兄”。说云自称是什么大领袖的谎言是从一个专为诋毁他而设立的网站上传出来的，根本没有现实依据。

9. “云弟兄从来不是中国主流家庭教会的领导人。”

这一点完全正确！云的确不是全国主流家庭教会网络的领导人之一，

No Chinese Translation 10: (known as the 'Lao Da' in China)

無中文翻譯 10：（在中國被稱為「老大」）

而且他也从未如此宣称过。在他的书中也没有这样的暗示。云是个传道人，之所以颇有声望，是因为神赐给他能力带领许多人归主，就像他书中所清晰描绘的那样。他还参与领导当地一些训练中心的事工和聚会，可从来没当自己是中国教会的大领袖之一。他始终是一名服侍神子民的仆人。大家都能看到，他的努力给各家庭教会的带领人之间带来了合一，而且他从来没有将自己放在任何这一切之前。

10. “云弟兄被外国人利用以达到他们自己的目的。”

这种说法暗示云有点愚昧无知，被人愚弄、受人利用。他可不是这样的人。在西方和云一起配搭服事的基督徒，比如他的翻译和其他同工和他有着多年的莫逆之交，他在国内和出国后，他们一直和他保持着长期有益的关系，有着很深的信任。他们共同为主面临许多争战。另外，和云一起作巡回布道的西方人并不是不负责任的，他们的事工都有董事会监督他们的人品和行为。再说一次，这个谴责是完全没有根据的。

云弟兄现在怎么样？

我相信那些反对云的人要更不高兴了，因为他们的诽谤与攻击非但没有达到目的，而且还提高了云为主做工的能见度，为他打开了前所未有的机会之门！云靠着神的恩典并没有退缩。

法利赛迦玛列对于他不能明白的事情并没有意欲阻止，反而说：“现在，我劝你们不要管这些人，任凭他们吧！他们所谋的、所行的，若是出于人，必要败坏；若是出于神，你们就不能败坏他们，恐怕你们倒是攻击神了。（徒 5:38-39）”。假如我们都像他那样有智慧岂不是好？

若是云的事工不是出于神，那就必定要败坏；若神与他同在，攻击他的那些人所谋的也必定不会有长久的影响。

也许《天上人》一书的评论人洪大卫（David I Hong）的总结最为贴切：

> “我很惊骇有人企图诽谤这位弟兄及其见证。他们的指控是极度的假冒伪善……要么就是另一个事工机构中有部分人不赞同云弟兄的神奇见证。愿主严厉地处置所有这些作假见证诋毁这位弟兄的人。他已经体验了天国的滋味，也领略了那位天国的创造者。他的确是热爱耶稣的天上人。我竭力推荐这本书。请不要听信围绕这个人的虚假指控，而要在灵里祷告，自己来验证这些事情。他是真实的。赞美主！”

当马来西亚的一家基督徒杂志就如何回答“对你的指控，说你是个骗子，你的见证是个大谎言”向云弟兄提出疑问时，他照常言简意赅地直指要点：

> “好树都结好果子；坏树结坏果子。凭着果子，你就可以认出这是好树还是坏树。人们怎么说我并不重要，重要的是耶稣知道我是谁，我也知道自己是谁。我知道我在事奉谁。其实我不太喜欢对那些攻击作出解释或澄清什么，因为按照神的话，每个人都要背着自己的十字架来跟随耶稣。而对于那些攻击我的人，我绝对没有任何敌意。”

最近云弟兄就“回归耶路撒冷”这一异像和他的同工们作了如下分享：

> “在遭遇巨大反对与艰难困苦之后，圣经说：‘大卫却倚靠耶和华他的 神，心里坚固（撒上 30:6）。’神始终是我们前进的道路，祂永远是那黑暗隧道尽头的亮光和我们在猛烈风暴中的拯救。纵然魔鬼用最猛烈的风暴来击垮我们，然而我们却能够靠主来抵挡！在祂里面我们有内心的力量、平安和满溢的喜乐！发生在我们周围的那些事情都没什么大不了的，攻向我们的炮火再猛烈也无法触及耶稣在我们里面的内在生命。这就是为什么成千上万名殉道者无论遭受了多么残酷的折磨，依然英勇赴死的原因。我们里面隐藏着一个奥秘，人手摸不到，火焰烧不着……
>
> 当神赐下命令的时候，地狱的魔鬼无法阻止神话语的传播。我绝对相信神已经向中国的教会赐下命令，要在中东、中亚、东南亚以及基督之名未被高举的每一处角落广传福音、建立神的国度……如今你听到了神的命令，我祷告无论神把你放在什么样的环境里，愿你都立场坚定、奋勇向前。不要放弃，不要向反对势力屈服。这只不过是神在考验我们、锤炼我们，这样我们就能成为神手中更加有力的武器。使徒保罗在他的事工中总有双重因素产生：反对和果效。在他给哥林多教会的信中写道：“因为有宽大又有功效的门为我开了，并且反对的人也多（林前 16:9）。”若没有人反对，我们就不会像神希望的那样有力；若没有逼迫， 中国就不会有复兴；若基督没有被钉十

字架，就没有复活的大能。

让我们共同祈求进一步的异像和决心，始终“仰望为我们信心创始成终的耶稣，祂因那摆在前面的喜乐，就轻看羞辱，忍受了十字架［的苦难］，便坐在 神宝座的右边。那忍受罪人这样顶撞的，你们要思想，免得疲倦灰心。（来 12:2-3）”。

到这里我的“公开信”也将近尾声。感谢您花时间读这封信，了解了发生在一个神的仆人身上的故事。他对神和对人的爱超过了一切，我很荣幸和他度过了美好的时光。

我不打算再为此事耗费更多的笔墨了，因为我觉得该说的都已经说了。接受不接受都是人的自由。

撒旦利用所有这些愚蠢的事情想把我们的眼睛从神国的工作上移开，让我们为此认罪悔改，重新再一次把自己摆上，为主做工。

No Chinese Translation 11: This is what I plan to do, and I know this is the desire of Brother Yun's heart.

中文翻譯11：這是我打算做的，我知道這也是雲兄的心願。

如此猛烈的谣言、诽谤和争议风潮向这位质朴爱主的人涌来，由此绝大多数人都一致认为云弟兄在国内为信仰经历了众多的磨难和逼迫。如今他出了中国，倘若部分基督的肢体取代了中国监狱守卫和警察曾经扮演的角色，而我们居然也成了用言语和误传来进行人格诋毁的始作俑者，这是怎样的一场悲剧啊！这就是如今发生在云弟兄身上的真实写照。让我们把自己放在他的立场上想想，那一定是何等的艰难。

假如您对云弟兄的见证和他的人品（或对此事的其他方面）有任何疑问，请您鼓起勇气，按照圣经所教导的，直接和他联系，不要依赖任何二手或道听途说的信息。云弟兄始终愿意坐下来回答您的任何问题。至今我还没有见到有谁花时间和云弟兄一同祷告后仍然认为他是个骗子或说谎者而转身离去的。我们听到关于某人的不好的事情，我相信除非我们存心要与这个人作对，否则我们无权把这些事情重复给别人听。或许这就是耶稣所说的：“我又告诉你们，凡人所说的闲话，当审判的日子，必要句句供出来；因为要凭你的话，定你为义；也要凭你的话，定你有罪（太 12:37）。”

最后，我愿意把包德宁牧师为云弟兄写的声明作为结束。正如许多真心爱云弟兄的弟兄姊妹一样，他们都很尊重云弟兄，知道他是一个为人正直、敬畏神、全心热爱耶稣的人：

“我自 80 年代初期就跟云弟兄很熟悉了，很久以前西方教会就知道他了。我仔细观察过他的事工，在许多场合和他一起周游全中国。我也认识他的家人，也知道他在其他中国传道人之中所做的见证。他在欧洲服事期间我也和他在一起，我听到过无数来自世界各地的消息，说许多人因着他的服事得到了很大的祝福。作为属神的人，他为人正直，无论是过去还是现在，他一直都在为神的国度作贡献。我全力支持他。”



by Paul Hattaway

Evasive Open letter of Paul Hattaway, Asia harvest 楊天民 詭辯遁詞公開信 英文原版

Open letter from Asia Harvest -- This evasive open letter conceals eleven English paragraphs that the author dared not translate into Chinese for Chinese readers to see. They are **highlighted here in red text.**

Please first read the material that prompted this evasive open letter: 1."The Heavenly Man - a big von man of China," written by Brother Samuel Lamb Lin Xiangao; and 2.The open letter of Wisdom, Mercy and Courage—from the most representative leaders and co-workers of the Chinese house church movement. These are the matters that Asia Harvest's Hattaway has avoided addressing directly.

Regarding this highly toxic open letter containing evasive rhetoric, Brother Samuel Lamb （Lin XianGao）has a very effective antidote. Please read it carefully first to avoid being corrupted by Hattaway: Lin Xian Gao rebuts Paul Hattaway's evasive open letter(in Chinese and English)

~~~~~~

Open letter regarding the heavenly man

by Paul Hattaway

I would like to ask you for your most valuable commodity - your time. Twenty minutes should be enough. My request is that I might be able to openly share my heart about a matter of concern that has grown among some sections of the Body of Christ in recent months.

Introduction
~~~~~~

From the outset of this letter I want to clarify that I have no desire to attack anyone at all. This is not the motivation. The desire in writing this letter is to stand up for the truth, and to let the Body of Christ know that there is a totally different side to a controversy currently raging throughout Asia and in many places around the world. Edmund Burke once famously said, "The only thing necessary for the triumph of evil is for good men to do nothing." In a similar vein the Bible says, "Do not allow what you consider good to be spoken of as evil" (Rom. 14:16). This verse has been weighing on my heart. After consulting close friends and advisors, I am convinced that now is the time to speak out on the matter which I am about to. Nobody has asked me to write this letter. I am not a member of any board or committee of the Back to Jerusalem movement, nor do I receive any royalties from The Heavenly Man book, as I agreed to before I started writing the book. I write this Open Letter simply as a friend wanting to testify on behalf of another.

In 2001 I wrote a book called The Heavenly Man. It is the testimony of Chinese Christian Brother Yun. To gather background information and verify the testimonies included in the book I interviewed many people in China who were eyewitnesses to the events, as well as spending a few weeks with Brother Yun going over his story.

Even while writing the book I knew two things would happen. First, I knew the book would touch and bless many people's lives, simply because Yun's testimony is remarkable. I knew that despite his weaknesses and flaws, here was a man who walked with God in a way that Christians around the world hungered to see demonstrated. In Western churches especially there seemed to me to be a growing desperation among believers who were sick and tired of tradition and the status quo - they know there must be more to the Christian life than they had experienced. In Yun's life and testimony there is an example of humility, faith and perseverance that could speak into the lives of many Christians.

The second thing I was quite sure would happen is that the book would bring great opposition from some in the Christian world. It seems that change is rarely - if ever - welcomed in the Church. Church history has shown it is easier for a sleeping church to attack the messengers of change that God sends, rather than accept their teachings and possible corrections. This was the case with the Old Testament prophets whom God sent to Israel, and this has been the case throughout Church history to the present day.

The ironic thing is that Yun's message is really nothing new or revolutionary at all. In fact, it is as old as the Bible. His message is centered on the cross of Jesus Christ, and the victory of faith that comes to those who trust in the Lord, even in the face of great trials and persecution.

Both of my predictions for the book have proven true!

The Positive Impact of the Book

Let me start with the positive side. At the present time hundreds of thousands of The Heavenly Man books have been distributed, in almost twenty different languages. In the United Kingdom it was even

voted 'Christian Book of the Year' for 2003, and 'Best Biography' in 2004. I have been really blessed and encouraged by the feedback of Christians from all parts of the world - from India to Iceland, Argentina to Zimbabwe - who have written to say how the book challenged and inspired them to a deeper walk with the Lord. A pastor of a small church in England wrote to say he was deeply touched by the Holy Spirit after reading the book that he purchased one for every family in the church. They too were inspired, and motivated to pray more and share the Gospel. Due to this fresh commitment to the Lord the church doubled in size in a short space of time!

Even some well-known Christian leaders have been blessed by the book. The late German evangelist Reinhard Bonnke wrote,

"You may begin reading the book The Heavenly Man on your couch, but you will finish it on your knees. This is what happened to me. Anyone reading these pages will not remain the same. Brother Yun's testimony wakes and shakes us up. This is the message: In the fiercest persecution God's people, filled with the Holy Spirit, are invincible! They out live and out die the enemies of God and fill the world with the glorious Gospel of Jesus Christ. We are condemned to Victory! This is not only true for China, but also for the rest of the world."

On the Amazon.com website many readers have expressed their thankfulness to God, such as...

Mages of Malaysia, who wrote:

"This book is a gift from God to us in this end times. It will make you realize how unworthy you are in your own faith with the Lord. No words are good enough for this book and the faith that was shown by Brother Yun was beyond comprehension... You just have to read it because if you don't, you've just missed a gift from God. God Bless you and may He speak to you the way He has to me through this wonderful book."

Andrew of Columbus, Ohio:

"From the very first chapter, I was blown away! Next to the Bible, it has been the most convicting and moving book I've ever read. I realize more how good it is to know Jesus and how sovereign He is over the world and in our lives. The book's convicted me to desire to live a more sacrificial life for God, given me more of a heart for the nations and scripture, and renewed in me my sense of need for God's Spirit and presence. I highly recommend this book."

Leonardo, from Cebu in the Philippines:

"I wish I could give this book six or seven stars. There are a few truly rare books out there that can genuinely change your life for the better: this is definitely one of those books... It's a modern-day classic that will, perhaps, challenge your faith and your life as no other book you may ever read... This is what genuine... heart CHRISTianity is all about. The book is a rare treasure. Don't miss it, OR the Message."

And finally, Lawrence of Akron, Ohio:

"I read this book when I was on a mission trip to Africa and despite my busy schedule I was able to read the 350 page book in 48 hours. This is the best book I have ever read. I sat in the middle of Africa

reading this book, and it left me grateful for everything. I finished with the strongest desire to see the Kingdom of God come no matter what the cost. The story and life of Brother Yun created an unquenchable desire to go to China... I will be there in June one year after reading the book. I HIGHLY recommend this book to anyone. The most skeptical of people will be left amazed by Brother Yun's life and sacrifice for The Kingdom of God!"

These brief testimonies are a small sample of how thousands of people have felt, and for that we are grateful to the Lord. May He be glorified!

'Smoke and Fire' Theology

At the same time as these encouraging events have unfolded I have watched as a campaign has arisen strongly attacking Brother Yun's integrity and his testimony. At first I didn't think too much of the attacks, putting them down to the constant opposition that anyone serving God inevitably faces. Having known Brother Yun for a number of years and have seen the slander and opposition he has endured. Some of it could only be described as extraordinary.

The main source of these attacks is a website hosted by a Chinese man living in Hamburg, Germany. On the website he gives his name as Lin Mushe, but his real name is Titus Pan. This website is completely dedicated to trying to destroy one person - Brother Yun. It is in Chinese, English, and German, and spares no effort in trying everything possible to make Yun look bad. It is full of outright lies, slander, half-truths, and nonsense. It has even gone so far as to publish fake letters from Chinese believers denouncing Brother Yun. When these people were contacted they were shocked and distressed that their names had been falsely used to slander a brother whom they loved and respected. According to a statement issued by eight respected Chinese pastors who investigated the claims made on this website,

"Unfortunately, there is "someone" living in Hamburg, Germany, who keeps sending out accusations through the internet, email, letters, cassette tapes and CDs to discredit brother Yun's reputation. We have checked the accusations thoroughly and found the accusations to be false, baseless and a distortion of the true facts. In addition, certain persons being quoted in the accusations also deny having discredited brother Yun in anyway. They also expressed their displeasure of being falsely used, out of context, and without their consent and by distortion of the true facts."

To read a full English translation of the eight pastors' letter, Click Here (now diaspear) or to download the original Chinese document Click Here (中文). (Now disapear)

Dennis Balcombe, a well-known figure in China ministry and the pastor of Revival Christian Church in Hong Kong, says,

"I am aware of the attacks of Titus Pan against Brother Yun and the reasons behind them. From the very beginning I took a strong stand against these malicious attacks and have told Titus Pan my position on many occasions. It is sad and regretful that he would allow the enemy of the church to work through

him in this way. All that he has said and is saying is totally false. We pray the Lord will work in the hearts of sincere people to see the truth and support Brother Yun, whom God has raised up."

Bizarre as these accusations were, many Christians (especially Chinese believers living outside China) have believed these accusations. Surprisingly, even some senior well-respected mission leaders were taken in by them. Various critics and opponents have emerged, some intent on doing all they can to destroy Brother Yun and his reputation through gossip and innuendo, content to pass on false information as fact without making any effort to verify it. This false information spread like wild fire not only among Chinese Christians, but to many Western missionaries and pastors have also jumped on the bandwagon, even though "they do not know what they are talking about or what they so confidently affirm" (1 Tim. 1:7). Almost every day I receive emails from people who have heard something via someone else, who in turn met someone who read it on the Internet!

This kind of reasoning is completely unbiblical and extremely dangerous for God's people to indulge in. All Satan has to do in order to destroy the reputation of one of God's children is to start a few rumors. He knows all he has to do is put it out there and the believers will do the rest of the job for him! This is exactly what has been happening in the case of Brother Yun. In China, for whatever reason, this sin tends to be especially prevalent. It is sometimes difficult to find anyone who has anything good to say about anyone else. I believe it is one of the biggest weaknesses of the Chinese Church, and one of the main threats to the tremendous revival that God has blessed them with in this generation.

No Chinese Translation 1: Part of the problem is that around the world the Chinese house churches are usually presented in all their glory, as great men and women of God who live in perfect harmony. It is thought that some leaders have suffered in prison for so long that they are practically sinless! The reality is a little more down-to-earth. It has been said "The Chinese Church has a New Testament kind of Christianity." I agree! But in the New Testament we read not only of miracles and revival, but also of personal conflict, jealousy, opposition, and "false brothers." A glance at the messages the Risen Christ gave to the seven churches in the early chapters of Revelation will soon reveal the early Christians were just like us - with many weaknesses and failings.

Many people practice a kind of theology that says, "If there is smoke there must be fire." The thinking is that if there is controversy about a brother, then chances are the accusations are true, at least in part. This kind of theology is completely unbiblical and dangerous. If it were true, then Jesus would be a sinner! He was strongly accused of all kinds of sins by the Pharisees and others. He was a highly controversial figure. There was plenty of 'smoke' around Jesus, but no fire except the one burning in his heart for the lost. Numerous other Biblical figures were accused of various dirty and devious things that were untrue: Moses, Aaron, Isaiah, Jeremiah, Nehemiah, Joshua, Joseph, the Apostle Paul... just to name a few.

'Friendly Fire' in the Church

In recent years soldiers fighting in Iraq have used a new expression to describe the very worst kind of way to die or be injured in battle. They explain that if they were killed or wounded by an enemy bullet they would consider it a great honor, but the worst insult they could experience is to be wounded by 'friendly fire'. It is a terrible feeling to be shot by fellow soldiers whom you thought were on the same side!

Unfortunately, and tragically, 'friendly fire' is alive and well among God's people today. Christians like Brother Yun would consider it a great honor to be shot dead by a Muslim or speared by a tribesman while they are preaching the gospel in some far-flung corner of the earth. But to come under fire from fellow Christians, who are meant to be fighting on your side, is a miserable and terrible thing to have to cope with.

It is sad commentary that some Christians assume the worst about people they know nothing about. If there is a new preacher going around with a message worth listening to, assumptions about his motives and integrity are often made, such as, "They must be in it for the money," or "He is deceiving people with his false message."

How sad and grievous this is to the Holy Spirit!

Although the term 'friendly fire' may be relatively new, sadly it has been practiced among believers since the Church was birthed in the Book of Acts. All throughout Christian history we can find God's revival fires being quenched by church leaders, many of whom did so out of ignorance and zeal to 'protect' the Gospel. More often than not, however, they were persecuting that which they didn't understand.

Many of the great Christian leaders throughout history have been the subject of brutal attacks from other Christians. Journalist Alex Buchan commented on some of these in a November 21, 1997, article of Compass Direct. Buchan, whose article was actually about a slanderous attack by a prominent Chinese house church leader against another, said,

"Perhaps his reaction meant more to me because I had a similar feeling a few days before, reading about the Church Fathers. I stared aghast as the great Tertullian lays into Praxeous, the heretic, in the most uncharitable terms imaginable. I read with disappointment the downright ungraciousness of the so-called Doctor of Grace, St. Augustine, as he calls for the Donatist sect to be punished by military force. It seems to be a fact that many of the great heroes of the faith burned with as fierce a hatred toward those they perceived to be the enemies of God, as they were inflamed with love for God."

Sadly, 'friendly fire' is not new in China either. Recently, while researching for a new book, I read how the Nestorian Christians strongly attacked John of Montecorvino at Beijing in the year 1305. John had

baptized 6,000 people in the preceding years, but was called a "spy, magician, and deceiver of men" by the jealous Nestorians. John later commented, "If not for all the slanders I should have baptized more than 30,000."

During the Welsh Revival of the early 1900s God used a young man named Evan Roberts as the main instrument of blessing to a dry and thirsty nation. Most Welsh clergy of the day, however, strongly opposed Roberts' ministry, fearing the influence he would have on "their" congregations. Several full page advertisements were taken out by Welsh pastors in the newspapers of the day, denouncing Evan Roberts as a heretic and swindler. Dozens of pastors put their signature to the slanderous attacks.

Today, the name of Evan Roberts is fondly remembered around the world as the human vessel that God used to bring revival to Wales one hundred years ago. Few can remember the name of even one of his detractors. The same can be said of revivalists like Charles Finney and D.L. Moody, who were also strongly denounced by other Christian leaders.

No Chinese Translation 2 （This section was later secretly deleted by the author, who dared not show it to Westerners）:

Even Billy Graham has been strongly attacked throughout the years of his faithful ministry for his Lord. His autobiography records how a series of early meetings in England met with tremendous opposition from the churches, who opposed him and did all they could to send the evangelist back to America. A friend of mine who attended a Billy Graham crusade in the United States several years ago told me of his astonishment when he saw a group of Christians protesting outside the stadium, holding up signs saying things like, "Don't listen to this man. His teaching will send you to hell!"

The first thing we need to realize is who is really behind all attacks against the children of God. The Bible says, "For our struggle is not against flesh and blood, but against the rulers, against the authorities, against the powers of this dark world and against the spiritual forces of evil in the heavenly realms" (Eph. 6:12). How blind we can be! We cannot fight both the kingdom of darkness and each other at the same time, so Satan knows if he can turn Christian against Christian, he has already won the battle. Paul pointed this out to the Corinthian believers long ago, when he wrote, "The very fact that you have lawsuits among you means you have been completely defeated already" (1 Cor. 6:7).

The Attacks on Brother Yun

As mentioned previously, a website has been set up by a Hamburg, Germany-based Chinese man named Titus Pan, who calls himself 'Lin Mushe' on the internet. He bitterly declares Brother Yun to be a fraudulent con-man, a liar, and a thief.

I would like to ask one simple question to start. You may have heard the expression, "I couldn't see the forest for all the trees." Am I stating the obvious to suggest that a Christian should find it strange, and suspicious at best, if one professing Christian should have an entire website dedicated to trying to destroy another Christian?

There seems no limit to the variety of ways these attacks on Brother Yun have been launched. The internet, email campaigns, videos, cassette tapes, DVDs... have all emanated from the same source. It is not worth speculating why Pan has been so motivated to do this. All of my efforts to contact him have been left unanswered. What is even stranger is that Titus Pan in the late 1990s was a strong advocate for Brother Yun, even being the first person in the West to publicly promote Yun and his testimony.

No Chinese Translation

（This section was later secretly deleted by the author, who dared not show it to Westerners）: Link. (For example, see the "China" testimony here).

All these attacks were only causing minimal reaction until the website in Germany managed to convince three church leaders from China (all of whom have since passed away) - Samuel Lamb, Moses Xie and Allen Yuan - to sign a letter of opposition to Brother Yun, telling him he should "repent before it is too late." Samuel Lamb even penned a short article entitled 'The Heavenly Man - China's Great Con Man,' which he distributes in both Chinese and English to anyone who visits his church.

Many people reason that if these three elderly respected leaders from China say Yun is a liar, then surely it must be true. After all, Pastor Lamb spent more than twenty years in prison for the Gospel and is looked up to by Christians all around the world as a heroic kind of statesmen of the persecuted church. Surely someone like him would never issue a denunciation against another brother unless it was true?

Firstly, let me say that it is a good thing for the Body of Christ to be wary of charlatans, deceivers, and heretics. In fact, the Bible exhorts us to do so, and such perversions are one of the signs that we live in the end times (see Matt. 24:4-5 for example). If Brother Yun was guilty of even a fraction of the terrible things being said about him, then it would be a duty to warn others about him. However, the Bible also clearly lays out the way people should go about discovering if a person is in error or a danger to others. If these principles are not adhered to, then all someone has to do to destroy another's reputation is to make up some lies and pass them on. There are usually enough gossipers around to ensure such lies will get wide circulation.

The first thing that the Bible lays out in such circumstances is that the accused person should be confronted. Jesus taught, "If your brother sins against you, go and show him his fault, just between the

two of you. If he listens to you, you have won your brother over. But if he will not listen, take one or two others along, so that 'every matter may be established by the testimony of two or three witnesses'. If he refuses to listen to them, tell it to the church; and if he refuses to listen even to the church, treat him as you would a pagan or a tax collector" (Matt. 18:15-17). The Apostle Paul taught what to do when a brother has been trapped in a sin: "Brothers, if someone is caught in a sin, you who are spiritual should restore him gently. But watch yourself, or you also may be tempted" (Gal. 6:1).

Have these principles of confrontation followed in this case against Brother Yun? No Chinese translation 3: Did Samuel Lamb or the other elderly Chinese brothers attempt to go to Brother Yun about any 'concerns' they may have?

No!

In fact, it may surprise you to learn that Pastor Samuel Lamb admits**he has never even met**Brother Yun before, nor has he read his book - either in Chinese or English. The fact is, Lamb knows little about Yun's life or ministry, except what he had been told by Titus Pan (Lin Mushe), and therefore his attack is meaningless and senseless. Surely such an attack on the integrity of one person by another who has not even met him carries no credibility at all!

I have personally carried Bibles and met with Samuel Lamb in his church at least ten or fifteen times since the late 1980s. I last spoke with him as recently as the morning of June 27, 2005. I found him as friendly and charming as ever. He admitted that he had never met Yun before, and that if he had the opportunity to do so, he would refuse, because Yun is "a bad man." Pastor Lamb also said he had learned about this from 'Lin Mushe' (Titus Pan) of Germany. When I suggested the source of his information may be lying, Lamb chuckled but didn't answer. When I asked if he thought it was right to denounce someone he had never met, the response was once again a disarming chuckle, and nothing else. He is still handing out his 'Con Man' article to those who visit his church. Similarly, our colleagues have tried to speak with the other two Beijing-based brothers, Moses Xie and Allen Yuan, about this but they also are very hesitant to explain why they have signed the statement. These two dear Christian men admit they met Yun many years ago, but never since.

Even the secular world doesn't listen to such testimony. No Chinese translation 4: Can you imagine the scene in court where one person is accusing the other of some horrible crime? The judge leans forward and asks the accuser, "How long have you known this man?" The accuser, red-faced, whispers, "Ah, actually I have never met him before your honor..." This situation is no less ridiculous, but many believers have immediately assumed the accusations against Brother Yun are true because of the weight of these three men's reputations.

Unfortunately this kind of character assassination is all too prevalent in China today. In December 2004 an American missionary whom God has used to be a blessing throughout China sent a lengthy email to

many different leaders of China ministries, rebuking them for the same thing - the spreading of gossip and slander among the missionary community. This letter had nothing to do with Brother Yun's situation at all, but was regarding similar accusations against yet another house church leader in China. Part of this brother's treatise said,

"Some believe it is their ministry to say what they think and repeat what they hear. I was taught that we will give an account to God for every idle word that we speak. There seems to be a dangerous lack of the fear of God today, especially with those in China ministry... Some seem to thrive on negativity. Missions is a competitive field (for some). We need to write newsletters. We need to impress people and raise money. Often we feel that we need to have a story; or some incident to fight for or against. All of this can make us unreliable reporters.

"Why do people fly to China and schedule meetings to hear stories about leaders? If the brother is guilty, all will come out publicly; either in this life or at the Judgment Seat of Christ. The Holy Spirit does not need you or me to be His voice in the world, warning us of our brothers' sins... In fact, the accusations people make will in no way affect the outcome of the life or ministry of any servant of the Lord. God has not given you or I that kind of power. He alone is sovereign."

The writer, who had many years experience working in Communist countries in Eastern Europe and the Soviet Union before coming to China, touched on another serious aspect to Christian work in Communist countries - the fact that some church leaders have compromised and become tools in the hands of the authorities. In effect, some of the most vicious attacks and slanderous campaigns are launched by the government, using pastors and leaders who they have managed to corrupt. He says,

"In a Communist country it doesn't matter if one hundred trusted sources tell you something, it could still be a lie. That is why the Scriptures give us clear guidelines on how to deal with these issues... There are many traitors in the Chinese House Church; we would be naïve to think otherwise."

Throughout all of these struggles I have watched Brother Yun closely, and have been amazed at his godly responses to all of the criticism leveled against him. Not only has he refused to get into any public debate with anyone, he has completely forgiven all of his persecutors and holds no grudges at all.

What is Brother Yun's response to these three old patriarchs of the Chinese Church? Is he bitter and looking for revenge? Well, let's see what Yun says in a remarkable statement on the Back to Jerusalem website:

In the presence of the Lord I would like to say I hold absolutely nothing against the men of God who wrote the booklet about me, and I have completely forgiven them. In fact, the booklet did not reduce the deep respect I have in my heart towards these men. I know that one day we will embrace before our Father in Heaven and any misunderstanding will be forgotten as we worship the Lamb of God together.

If anyone has any questions about my story, or any other enquiry, I am very willing to meet either publicly or privately and answer any questions that anybody may have.

Let's put aside all hindrances and march forward hand in hand for the sake of the kingdom of God!

The Wave Spreads around the World

The publication on the internet of these false accusations against Brother Yun have just served to embolden those who already wish to see his downfall. Several Christian newspapers and magazines have taken up the story. Even a number of Western and Asian mission leaders have jumped on the bandwagon. I can imagine the devil laughing as thousands of Christians who had been blessed and encouraged by Yun's testimony felt their hearts sink as they read how three old Chinese church leaders had denounced Yun and his story as false. The surge of spiritual hope and faith that many believers felt when they read Yun's book was extinguished by these accusations.

In America the rumurs and false information have also started to weave their way through the Body. No Chinese translation 5: One large church in Wisconsin even purchased 1,000 The Heavenly Man books for the members of their congregation, only to send them back to the publisher after they were told the story is untrue by a visiting mission leader. Then a number of Korean church leaders publicly denounced Brother Yun as a heretic and con man, even though Yun had never even been to Korea, and the people who released the statement had never met him or spoken to him.

Thankfully, not everyone is so quick to rush to such poor and unbiblical judgment. One large ministry in Malaysia has displayed wisdom in their handling of this. Late last year Yun was invited to speak in a series of meetings throughout Malaysia, where his book has impacted thousands of people's lives. The meetings were arranged by the National Evangelical Christian Fellowship of Malaysia (NECF), a well-known and respected national church body.

During the meetings more than 1,200 people across Malaysia made first time commitments to follow Christ! Many repented of their sins and found God's mercy and grace as they became children of God. Many thousands more Christians were encouraged, challenged, and built up in their own walk with God through Yun's ministry. No Chinese translation 6: As usual, Yun refused to leave each meeting place until all the people who wanted to meet him and talk with him had the chance to do so. Sometimes this meant he did not get to sleep until the early hours of the morning as hundreds of people stayed behind for prayer or just to have a chat with Brother Yun. I have personally seen on numerous occasions how patient, kind and loving he is with people - giving them his full attention and displaying a genuine concern for their wellbeing. Yun figures that Jesus cares for people deeply, and so should he.

As with most places where Brother Yun goes now, the good came with the bad in Malaysia!

At the same time that God was using Brother Yun to touch many lives for Jesus, a strong opposition arose from numerous church leaders and others who had read the rumors against Brother Yun. No effort was spared to stop or disrupt the meetings. Each new city the NECF took Brother Yun they found a pile of emails, faxes and letters had preceded them, protesting the meetings and accusing Brother Yun of being a false prophet, among many other things. After all, they had read about it on the internet, so it must be true!

This placed the NECF in a difficult position. On one hand they had arranged the meetings, and on the other a storm had arisen slamming their guest speaker, accusing him of a string of dirty and dark deeds. Even some of the Malaysian pastors who had hosted Brother Yun in their homes came under strong attack for doing so!

Rev. Wong Kim Kong, the Secretary-General of the NECF who traveled around Malaysia with Brother Yun, later wrote,

"The Heavenly Man's visit to Malaysia caused quite a stir with thousands flocking to his meetings in Petaling Jaya, Kuala Lumpur, Penang, Ipoh, Malacca and Johor Baru. At the end of his whirlwind trip spanning the north and south of Peninsular Malaysia, many people had responded to his challenges to: receive Jesus as Savior, commit their lives to sharing the gospel, or participate in the Back to Jerusalem (BTJ) mission to bring the gospel to the many nations lying between China and Jerusalem.

Liu Zhenying - or Brother Yun as he is known worldwide - has indeed been an impactful witness for the Lord here. Yet, his visit was not without controversy. Even as he was preaching, e-mails questioning and attacking his authenticity were circulating fast. Most of them pointed to a website that was specially set up to refute his testimony, alleging he is a fraud who is out to gain wealth and status. The website carries pictures of several China house church leaders - such as Samuel Lamb Lin Xiangao, Moses Xie Moshan and Allen Yuan - signing a letter calling for his repentance."

You can read the whole articlehere.

Thankfully, Rev. Wong and the National Evangelical Christian Fellowship of Malaysia were mature Christians who have been 'around the block' a few times in Christian ministry. They judged Brother Yun not on the content of the accusations against him, but on the content of his Christ-like character and by the good fruit produced by his ministry. Rev. Wong later wrote another article called 'Sifting the Speaker,' which outlined the Biblical steps his organization takes when one of their invited speakers turns out to be controversial:

"What happens when the potential speaker is a controversial figure or whose reputation is riddled with rumors?

'Firstly, we will ascertain whether the rumors have any basis, bearing in mind that in our contemporary context, e-mails and other forms of media have been abused by unscrupulous people out to cause mischief and malign others,' Rev. Wong pointed out.

Character assassination can be due to many reasons, such as differences in personality, doctrines and ministries; ministry rivalry; envy; or just plain mischief.

We Christians are as prone to these carnal temptations as anyone else, so it's important to consider whether there's any of these going on between the accusers and the accused," he cautioned.

The information or accusations against the person concerned must be verified with various sources here and abroad, and not just one source, to ensure a fair hearing. 'We will also weigh the general consensus here and abroad towards the person. For example in the case of Brother Yun (of The Heavenly Man), he is highly regarded by David Pawson and Dennis Balcombe, both who are respected evangelical leaders worldwide.'"

Article: NECF.org.my, Sifting the Speaker

May other church and mission leaders apply the same kind of wisdom to their decisions!

The Witness of Brother Yun's Character

From my vantage point, the whole debate that has raged among many parts of the Church has divided into two main camps - those who don't personally know Brother Yun and those who do.

The many thousands of people around the world who have spent time with Brother Yun have found him to be a good man, humble, loving, and always eager to bless and build up others in Christ. Those who have attended a meeting where he has spoken have made up their own minds whether this man is someone who loves Jesus Christ, or a deceptive con man out for personal gain.

While I can assure you Brother Yun is certainly not yet perfect, having certain weaknesses and faults like any of us, he is far from being any of the rotten things his critics accuse him of being. In my experience, those who have met Brother Yun invariably see his humility and zeal for Jesus. There is good fruit resulting from his life wherever he goes with people saved and Christians becoming more committed to the Lord. Without doubt, Brother Yun has left good fruit for the Lord wherever he has preached the gospel. Jesus said, "By their fruit you will recognize them. Do people pick grapes from thornbushes, or figs from thistles? Likewise every good tree bears good fruit, but a bad tree bears bad fruit" (Matt. 7:16-17).

Gordon Hickson, a British pastor who has been working with the Back to Jerusalem movement in the UK, says:

"I have been working closely with Brother Yun and Back to Jerusalem now for several years. During this time I have organized many dozens of meetings for Brother Yun throughout the United Kingdom. For those people who know Yun, and know how his meetings are organized, this accusation that he misuses finances would be totally laughable if it wasn't so serious. The truth is that Brother Yun does

not handle a cent of any money that comes in from his meetings anywhere in the world. This has always been the case. He never emphasises donations at all, and has never asked a single person for anything except their prayers.

> *Article: Back To Jerusalem, Heavenly Man Still a Target for Persecution. (The file does not actually exist.)*

German Pastor Waldemar Sardaczuk is the President of a well-known European mission called Aktionskommitee fur Verfolgte Christen (AVC). Recently Waldemar testified:

> *"Brother Yun and his family have been living with us in Nidda, Germany for many years. We've got to know him and his wife very well. They are members of our church and are a great testimony in their walk with God. I met brother Yun in China many years ago. At that time I would have never thought it possible to meet him in Germany. However, God brought him out so he could be a blessing to the Church around the world. As with all men of God who are used by the Lord, Brother Yun has been the object of much slander, attack and jealousy... Brother Yun has been a great blessing and he is a servant of God who has opened our eyes to the situation of the Christians in China."*
>
> *Article: Back To Jerusalem, Heavenly Man Still a Target for Persecution. (The file does not actually exist.)*

There are countless allegations circulating against Brother Yun, but I am still waiting to meet a single person who has been wronged by him in any way.

Answering Specific Accusations

The number of different accusations and rumors I have heard about Brother Yun are so numerous that I haven't been able to remember them all! Some have been so ridiculous and childish that they do not deserve a response, such as "Brother Yun does not pray at all," "He is no longer walking with the Lord," "He was imprisoned because he is a gold smuggler," etc. Here is a summary of the main accusations that I keep hearing, rebutted one by one.

1. **"Brother Yun is a millionaire, living like a king in the West."** The truth is that Yun and his family live a modest life in Germany. A mission called AVC for years has provided housing for Yun and his family, and taken care of them. German Pastor Waldemar Sardaczuk shed light on Yun's lifestyle earlier this year:

"I can shed some light on the daily life of Brother Yun and his family... Neither he nor any of his family members drive or own a car. They are totally focused on ministering for the Lord, and have little concern for material things. His manner of life, his conduct, and his family are in accordance with the Bible. We are deeply impressed and also appreciate brother Yun's reaction to all the lies, slanders and accusations told about him... He has always endeavored to help the persecuted Christians in his country without any desire for personal gain or glory."

2. **"Brother Yun steals money raised at his meetings around the world."** This accusation is quite ridiculous as Yun does not handle a cent of any money raised anywhere! Yun decided years ago that he

wanted to do speaking tours which were hosted and arranged by existing ministries that were already involved in China and who have a good reputation. This is what they have been doing. This means that the host organization takes the offerings. Yun is glad, knowing that the money is going to end up being used to bless believers in China.

（Now Disappear。 This passage was later deleted by the author, who dared not allow readers to read it on their official website.）

For example, recently Yun had about 20 meetings in Europe, hosted by a mission. They collected the offerings and used them on their existing projects in China, where they have been working for 15-20 years already. This is also the case in other countries around the world where Yun speaks. In some meetings there are offerings that go directly to BTJ work. This money is sent to a Hong Kong-based organization that then sends it into China as designated. This organization's finances are independently audited. From donations given at Brother Yun's meetings around the world I know for a fact that many tens of thousands of Bibles have been printed, hundreds of evangelists supported and training centers established, plus many other forms of assistance that have helped to build up the Chinese Church. The terrible irony of these accusations is that by attacking Yun the indirect result has been to damage the work going on in China.

From donations given at Brother Yun's meetings around the world I know for a fact that many tens of thousands of Bibles have been printed, hundreds of evangelists supported and training centers established, plus many other forms of assistance that have helped to build up the Chinese Church. The terrible irony of these accusations is that by attacking Yun the indirect result has been to damage the work going on in China.

3. "Yun and his co-workers falsely claim there are 100,000 Chinese missionaries already outside China, or poised to leave China." Yun has never claimed this. The 100,000 figure is a vision that may take many years to see become a reality. Both The Heavenly Man and Back to Jerusalem books clearly state this. In the BTJ book (Not translated in the Chinese Version: p.105 in the US edition; p.126 in the UK edition) it says regarding the timing of this vision, "We do not have our own timeline; we just want to obey God's will and leave the timing to him." I see this issue of the 100,000 as something similar to the Joshua and Caleb situation in the Bible. There are those who see the potential of the Chinese missionary movement, even though it is still in its infancy, and those who can only see the problems. I am reminded of when Loren Cunningham, the founder of Youth With a Mission, started out. He had a vision of thousands of young people serving Jesus all around the world on the mission field, and openly shared his vision in churches, even though the reality at the time did not match the vision at all. Some church leaders even rebuked Cunningham for lying, much like they are still doing today to Brother Yun.

4. "The figure of 100,000 missionaries from China is hype and impossible to achieve."Most of today's estimates of the Church in China put the number of believers at between 50 million and 100 million. Let's assume the lower figure of 50 million is accurate. Is it unfeasible that the Chinese Church in this generation could send out just one out of every 500 of their believers as missionaries? Recently a Philippines-based trans-denominational organization called the Philippine Mission Mobilization Movement announced their vision to send 200,000 Filipino missionaries out! The Protestant Church in

South Korea, a country with a population about 25 times smaller than China, has already sent out 12,000 missionaries No Chinese translation 7: according to Patrick Johnstone's latest Operation World (p.387). The same source says in 2001 there were already 201,260 Protestant missionaries throughout the world (p.4), with possibly a similar number of Catholic missionaries.

5. "The Heavenly Man and Back to Jerusalem books have resulted in much persecution for the believers in China."This is nonsense. We have yet to hear of a single person who has been arrested on account of either of these books. In fact, if anything the number of arrests of believers in China has fallen in the past few years since these books were published.

6. "Brother Yun never fasted for 74 days in prison in 1984." Certainly I am aware that this testimony is extraordinary, and in fact completely impossible in human terms. But Jesus has said, "With man this is impossible, but not with God; all things are possible with God" (Mark 10:27). There are eyewitnesses of Brother Yun's condition at the end of the fast, including his pastor, his wife Deling, and his extended family all of whom saw his shrivelled body in the prison. Those who make this accusation were not there. Yet I was presented with strong evidence that Yun did, in fact, fast for 74 days while in prison in 1984. No Chinese translation 8: In researching the book I spent a couple of weeks with Brother Yun himself, going over his account. To make sure any language problems were minimized, I asked a Chinese friend from Taiwan, who has spent decades translating (including for leaders such as Billy Graham) to be involved with our interviews so that we could get an accurate translation. No stone was left unturned in our effort to achieve this. The testimony of Yun's 74 day fast in prison has been well known for many years now. Dennis Balcombe, the pastor of Revival Christian Church in Hong Kong, says,

"In 1991 I translated a book called Lilies Amongst Thorns. The author, Danyun, was actually a leading house church leader who spent two years carefully researching the testimonies of those featured in this book. With an educated Henan house church writer, he wrote the manuscripts that I translated. I myself did a lot of research to ascertain that the contents were accurate and factual. One chapter in this book is called "The Heavenly Man" in which there are 57 pages of Brother Yun's life which are identical in detail to the first part of Paul Hattaway's The Heavenly Man book. The sources of the materials are different, but the contents the same. Long before Yun was well known or there was any controversy about his testimony, people in Henan spoke openly of his testimony of being in prison, fasting and prayer and other details that are well known now."

Perspective is a funny thing. While some Western believers ridicule this testimony and say it is completely impossible, when I shared it with some pastors from a remote area of Nagaland in northeast India, nobody seemed surprised or disbelieving. One pastor later told me why. He said in the 1960s, when a powerful revival was taking place, one pastor is known to have fasted for 100 days!

7. "Brother Yun never supernaturally escaped from prison in 1997." This has been one of the main issues of Pastor Samuel Lamb's attack on Brother Yun. When I researched Yun's book, I interviewed three eyewitnesses who saw this remarkable situation unfold with their very eyes. They were all pastors in prison with Yun at the time, having been arrested at the same meeting. Their testimonies proved to be consistent, even though I interviewed each of them at separate times and in different places. We also

have the testimony of the family whom Yun visited immediately after his escape. As a writer, it was not a difficult decision for me to include this testimony in Yun's book. On one side I had a group of eyewitnesses whose testimony correlated with Yun's, and on the other, the testimony of those who were not there and who know nothing about the situation. I want to go on record to say I remain confident that the testimonies I wrote in The Heavenly Man book are true and accurate.

8. **"Brother Yun is not the leader of the Chinese Church."** Amen! He has never claimed to be, and anyone who did so would be crazy. Jesus Christ is the leader of the Chinese Church. After he left China, Yun became an "authorized representative" of the Sinim Fellowship of house church leaders, who produced a letter No Chinese translation 9: which was translated and included in The Heavenly Man book (p.291-292). Anyone who knows Yun realizes that he does not want any attention focused on himself, so in the past few years he has asked to be introduced simply as "a Christian brother from China." The lie that Yun is claiming to be some great leader originated on the website set up to discredit him. It has no basis in reality.

9. **"Brother Yun was never a major house church leader in China."**This is entirely true! Yun was not one of the major national house church network leaders No Chinese translation 10: (known as the 'Lao Da' in China), and has never claimed to be. Nor does his book suggest that he was. Yun was an evangelist who was renowned for his God-given ability to lead many people to Christ, as his book clearly portrays. He also was involved with leading some local training centers and meetings, but was never considered one of the big leaders in China. He has been a servant to God's people, as evidenced by his efforts to bring unity between the different church leaders, and has never put himself forward as anything else.

(Now disappear - This passage Number 10 was later deleted by the author, who dared not allow readers to read it on their official website.)

10. **"Brother Yun is being used by foreigners for their own gain."**

This implies that Yun is somewhat ignorant and able to be tricked and used. He is anything but this. The Christians Yun works with in the West, such as his translator and others, have had a long and fruitful relationship with him many years, both inside China and since he came out. There is a deep level of trust in those relationships. Together they have faced many battles for the Lord. Furthermore, these Westerners who travel with Brother Yun are not without accountability. Their ministries have boards of directors who are responsible for the integrity of their actions. This accusation, once again, is completely groundless.

Where to Now for Brother Yun?

I believe those who oppose Yun are going to be increasingly unhappy because it seems their slanders and attacks have achieved nothing except to increase the visibility of his ministry for the Lord and open more doors of opportunity than before! Yun is not going away, by God's grace.

Wouldn't it be great if we chose to be as wise as Gamaliel the Pharisee, who didn't try to stop something he couldn't understand, but instead said, "Leave these men alone! Let them go! For if their

purpose or activity is of human origin, it will fail. But if it is from God, you will not be able to stop these men; you will only find yourselves fighting against God" (Acts 5:38-39).

If Yun's ministry is not from God it will surely fail. If God is with him, nothing that any of his attackers try to do with make any lasting impact.

Perhaps David I. Hong, one of the reviewers of The Heavenly Man book, sums it up best when he says,

"I am appalled at anyone who attempts to slander this brother and his testimony. Their accusations are pharisaical at best... or are part of another ministry that does not agree with Brother Yun's supernatural accounts. May the LORD deal with all of you ever so severely, all who testify falsely against this brother. He is a man who has tasted heaven and the very One Who created it. He is indeed a heavenly man in love with Jesus and I highly recommend this book. Please do not believe the false accusations surrounding this man. Please pray in the Spirit and test these things for yourself. He is genuine. Praise the Lord!"

When a Malaysian Christian magazine asked him what he had to say in reply "to the accusations that you are a fraud and that your testimony is a big lie?" Brother Yun gave a simple answer, straight to the point as usual:

"Good tree bears good fruit, bad tree bears bad fruit. From the fruit, you can know whether the tree is good or bad. What people say about me is not important. What is important is that Jesus knows who I am and I know who I am. I know whom I serve. I actually don't like to explain or clarify those attacks because according to God's Word, everyone has to bear his own cross to follow Jesus. But I have absolutely no ill feelings towards those who have attacked me."

Article: NECF.org.my, Bro. Yun: Rumours Obstruct Gospel

Recently Brother Yun shared a message from God's Word with some of his co-workers in the Back to Jerusalem vision. In part, he said:

"After encountering great opposition and hardship, the Bible records: 'But David found strength in the Lord his God' (1 Sam. 30:6). God is always the way forward. He is always the light at the end of our tunnel and the tower of strength to withstand the worst storm that the devil can throw at us! It is IN HIM that we find inward strength, peace, and overwhelming joy! I have learnt that it doesn't matter what is going on around us, or what fiery darts are aimed at us, they cannot touch the inner life of Jesus that lives inside of us. That is why so many thousands of martyrs have died courageous deaths in spite of cruel tortures. There was a secret, hidden inner place that no man could touch, and no flames could burn..."

When God gives such a word, no demon in hell will be able to stop it coming to pass. I have absolute confidence that God has given a word to the Church in China to preach the gospel and establish God's kingdom among all the peoples of the Middle East, Central Asia, Southeast Asia and everywhere Christ has not yet been named... As you hear the Word of God today, I pray you will be encouraged to stand and advance for God in whatever circumstance he has called you to. Do not give up, and do not bow to

opposition. It is merely there to test us and refine us so we can be a more effective weapon in the hand of God. The Apostle Paul always had these dual factors operating in his ministry: opposition and effectiveness. To the church in Corinth he wrote, "A great door for effective work has opened to me, and there are many who oppose me." (1 Cor. 16:9). Without opposition we will not be as effective as God wants us to be. Without persecution in China there would not have been revival, and without a crucifixion there would not have been a resurrection.

Let's pray for a new determination and a fresh vision, while all the time "Let us fix our eyes on Jesus, the author and perfecter of our faith, who for the joy set before him endured the cross, scorning its shame, and sat down at the right hand of the throne of God. Consider him who endured such opposition from sinful men, so that you will not grow weary and lose heart." (Heb. 12:2-3).

For the whole of this message from Brother Yun,Click Here.

And so I have come to the end of my "Open Letter". I thank you for spending the time reading about what is happening to a servant of God whose love for God and people is larger than anyone I have been privileged to spend time with.

I don't expect to write anything else on this matter, as I feel I have pretty much said all that needs to be said. People are free to either accept it or not.

Let's repent of all these foolish things that Satan has used to take our eyes off the work of God's kingdom, and rededicate ourselves to serve the Lord afresh once again. No Chinese translation 11: This is what I plan to do, and I know this is the desire of Brother Yun's heart. Out of all the huge groundswell of rumours, slander and controversy that has arisen around this simple-hearted man who loves God, one thing that most people agree on is that Brother Yun experienced a tremendous amount of persecution for his faith when he lived in China. Now that he is outside China, what an absolute tragedy it would be if certain sections of the Body of Christ took over the role that the prison guards and police used to do in China, and we become responsible for persecuting this brother with our words and our misinformed character assassinations. This appears to be exactly what is happening today to Brother Yun. Let us try to put ourselves in his position for a moment. It must be a terrible thing to have to go through.

If you have any questions about Brother Yun's testimony or his character (or anyone else's for that matter), please have the courage to do what the Bible says, and go to him. Don't rely on second or third hand information. Yun is not hard to find these days, and he is always willing to sit down and answer any question you may have. I have yet to meet anyone who has spent time praying with Brother Yun and went away believing he is a con man or a liar! I believe that unless we are willing to confront someone we have heard negative things about, we have no right to repeat those things to others. Perhaps this is part of what Jesus meant when he said, "But I tell you that men will have to give

account on the day of judgment for every careless word they have spoken. For by your words you will be acquitted, and by your words you will be condemned" (Matt. 12:36-37).

In closing, Dennis Balcombe has written the following endorsement of Brother Yun, the sentiments of which are echoed by countless other people who have come to love and respect Yun as a genuine, God-fearing man who loves Jesus with all his heart:

"I have known Brother Yun very well since the early 1980's, long before he was known in the West. I have seen closely his ministry, travelled with him on many occasions throughout China, know his family and the testimony he has among other Chinese evangelists. I have also been with him as he ministered in Europe and have heard countless reports from around the world given by many who have been greatly blessed and ministered to by him. He has my total support as a man of God with high integrity, who has in the past and is presently making a great contribution to the kingdom of God."